

Basis for the quotient space of matrices under equivalence

Kuize Zhang^{1,2}

¹*ACCESS Linnaeus Center, School of Electrical Engineering and Computer Science,
KTH Royal Institute of Technology,
Stockholm 10044, Sweden;*

²*College of Automation,
Harbin Engineering University,
Harbin 150001, China*

For several of the results (chosen from [1]) in the section **Preliminaries** of the corresponding **Letter**, we give different proofs than those in [1]. We also give proofs for our main results (Proposition 1 and Theorem 4) in the **Letter**.

Theorem 1. For every $\bar{A} \in \mathcal{M}$, in $\langle \bar{A} \rangle$ there exists a unique irreducible element.

Corollary 1. For every given $A \in \mathcal{M}$, let A_0 be the only irreducible element of $\langle A \rangle$. Then

$$\langle A \rangle = \{A_0 \otimes I_s \mid s = 1, 2, \dots\}. \quad (1)$$

Theorem 2. Consider the algebraic system $(\mathcal{M}_\mu, \mathbb{H})$, where $\mu \in \mathbb{Q}_+$. The relation $\text{IE} \sim$ is a congruence with respect to \mathbb{H} .

Proof. Arbitrarily chosen $\tilde{A}, A, \tilde{B}, B \in \mathcal{M}_\mu$, we assume $\tilde{A} \sim A$ and $\tilde{B} \sim B$. To prove this theorem, we need to verify $\tilde{A} \mathbb{H} \tilde{B} \sim A \mathbb{H} B$. We give an alternative proof compared to the one in [1].

By Theorem 1 and Corollary 1, there exist unique left irreducible matrices $A_0 \in \mathcal{M}_{\mu n \times n}$ and $B_0 \in \mathcal{M}_{\mu m \times m}$ such that

$$\begin{aligned} \tilde{A} &= A_0 \otimes I_s, \quad A = A_0 \otimes I_t, \\ \tilde{B} &= B_0 \otimes I_p, \quad B = B_0 \otimes I_q \end{aligned} \quad (2)$$

for some positive integers s, t, p, q . Set $T := \text{lcm}(ns, mp)$, $S := \text{lcm}(nt, mq)$, and $R := \text{lcm}(n, m)$. Then we have

$$\begin{aligned} \tilde{A} \mathbb{H} \tilde{B} &= (A_0 \otimes I_s \otimes I_{T/ns}) + (B_0 \otimes I_p \otimes I_{T/mp}) \\ &= (A_0 \otimes I_{R/n} \otimes I_{T/R}) + (B_0 \otimes I_{R/m} \otimes I_{T/R}) \\ &= (A_0 \otimes I_{R/n} + B_0 \otimes I_{R/m}) \otimes I_{T/R}. \end{aligned} \quad (3)$$

Similarly, we have

$$A \mathbb{H} B = (A_0 \otimes I_{R/n} + B_0 \otimes I_{R/m}) \otimes I_{S/R}. \quad (4)$$

(3) and (4) imply $\tilde{A} \mathbb{H} \tilde{B} \sim A \mathbb{H} B$.

Given $\mu \in \mathbb{Q}_+$, define the quotient space Σ_μ as

$$\Sigma_\mu := \mathcal{M}_\mu / \sim = \{\langle A \rangle \mid A \in \mathcal{M}_\mu\}. \quad (5)$$

Theorem 3. The quotient space (Σ_μ, \mathbb{H}) is a vector space.

Proposition 1. For every positive rational number $\mu = p/q$, where $p, q \in \mathbb{Z}_+$ are co-prime, the vector space (Σ_μ, \mathbb{H}) is of countably infinite dimension, and has a generator

$$\bigcup_{k \in \mathbb{Z}_+} \bigcup_{\substack{1 \leq i_{kp} \leq kp \\ 1 \leq j_{kq} \leq kq}} \left\{ \langle E_{i_{kp} j_{kq}}^{kp \times kq} \rangle \right\}, \quad (6)$$

where and hereinafter $E_{i_{kp} j_{kq}}^{kp \times kq}$ denotes the $kp \times kq$ matrix with the (i_{kp}, j_{kq}) -th entry equal to 1 and all other entries 0.

Proof. Arbitrarily chosen $\langle A \rangle$ in Σ_μ such that $A = (a_{ij})_{\substack{1 \leq i \leq k_0 p, \\ 1 \leq j \leq k_0 q}} \in \mathcal{M}_{k_0 p \times k_0 q}$ is the unique irreducible matrix of $\langle A \rangle$, we have

$$\langle A \rangle = \bigoplus_{\substack{1 \leq i \leq k_0 p \\ 1 \leq j \leq k_0 q}} a_{ij} \langle E_{ij}^{k_0 p \times k_0 q} \rangle$$

by Theorem 2. Hence the set (6) of countably infinite cardinality is a generator of the vector space (Σ_μ, \oplus) , and the dimension of (Σ_μ, \oplus) is at most countably infinite.

We claim that the dimension of (Σ_μ, \oplus) is countably infinite. Suppose the contrary: (Σ_μ, \oplus) is of finite dimension, then there exists a positive integer l such that

$$\bigcup_{1 \leq k \leq l} \bigcup_{\substack{1 \leq i_{kp} \leq kp \\ 1 \leq j_{kq} \leq kq}} \left\{ \langle E_{i_{kp} j_{kq}}^{kp \times kq} \rangle \right\}$$

is a generator of (Σ_μ, \oplus) . Hence for all matrices A in $\mathcal{M}_{(l+1)p \times (l+1)q}$, $\langle A \rangle$ can be generated by

$$\bigcup_{\substack{k \leq l \\ k|(l+1)}} \bigcup_{\substack{1 \leq i_{kp} \leq kp \\ 1 \leq j_{kq} \leq kq}} \left\{ \langle E_{i_{kp} j_{kq}}^{kp \times kq} \rangle \right\}, \quad (7)$$

where $k|(l+1)$ means k divides $l+1$.

It is not difficult to obtain that $\langle E_{12}^{(l+1)p \times (l+1)q} \rangle$ cannot be generated by (7), which is a contradiction, and hence completes the proof.

Note that for each positive integer l , the subset

$$\bigcup_{k=l}^{\infty} \bigcup_{\substack{1 \leq i_{kp} \leq kp \\ 1 \leq j_{kq} \leq kq}} \left\{ \langle E_{i_{kp} j_{kq}}^{kp \times kq} \rangle \right\}$$

of (6) is a generator of the vector space (Σ_μ, \oplus) , since for all positive integers k_1, k_2 such that k_1 divides k_2 ,

$$\bigcup_{\substack{1 \leq i_{k_1 p} \leq k_1 p \\ 1 \leq j_{k_1 q} \leq k_1 q}} \left\{ \langle E_{i_{k_1 p} j_{k_1 q}}^{k_1 p \times k_1 q} \rangle \right\}$$

is generated by

$$\bigcup_{\substack{1 \leq i_{k_2 p} \leq k_2 p \\ 1 \leq j_{k_2 q} \leq k_2 q}} \left\{ \langle E_{i_{k_2 p} j_{k_2 q}}^{k_2 p \times k_2 q} \rangle \right\}.$$

That is, (6) is not a basis of (Σ_μ, \oplus) . Next we use (6) to construct a basis for the vector space (Σ_μ, \oplus) .

Theorem 4. For every positive rational number $\mu = p/q$, where $p, q \in \mathbb{Z}_+$ are co-prime, the following countably infinite set of equivalence classes

$$D_\mu \cup N_\mu \quad (8)$$

is a basis for the vector space (Σ_μ, \oplus) , where¹⁾

$$\begin{aligned} D_\mu &= \bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} \bigcup_{\substack{1 \leq j \leq i \\ \gcd(i, j)=1}} \bigcup_{\substack{1 \leq k \leq p \\ 1 \leq l \leq q}} \left\{ \langle E_{kl}^{p \times q} \otimes E_{jj}^{i \times i} \rangle \right\}, \\ N_\mu &= \bigcup_{i=2}^{\infty} \bigcup_{\substack{1 \leq j_1, j_2 \leq i \\ j_1 \neq j_2 \\ \gcd(i, j_1, j_2)=1}} \bigcup_{\substack{1 \leq k \leq p \\ 1 \leq l \leq q}} \left\{ \langle E_{kl}^{p \times q} \otimes E_{j_1 j_2}^{i \times i} \rangle \right\}, \end{aligned} \quad (9)$$

where $\gcd()$ denote the greatest common divisor of numbers in $()$.

Proof. To prove this theorem, we need to show that i) (8) is a generator of (Σ_μ, \oplus) and ii) every finite number of elements of (8) are linearly independent. Fix co-prime positive integers p and q .

i): We next verify that for all positive integers i, k, l, j_1, j_2 satisfying $1 \leq k \leq p$, $1 \leq l \leq q$ and $1 \leq j_1, j_2 \leq i$, $\langle E_{kl}^{p \times q} \otimes E_{j_1 j_2}^{i \times i} \rangle$ is generated by (8). We divide the verification into two cases that $j_1 = j_2 =: j$ and $j_1 \neq j_2$.

Case 1, $j_1 = j_2$:

If $\gcd(i, j) = 1$, then $\langle E_{kl}^{p \times q} \otimes E_{jj}^{i \times i} \rangle \in D_\mu$, and $\langle E_{kl}^{p \times q} \otimes E_{jj}^{i \times i} \rangle$ is generated by (8). Next we assume that $\gcd(i, j) > 1$. Write

$$\begin{aligned} f_1 + f_2 + \cdots + f_{m'} &= j, \\ g_1 + g_2 + \cdots + g_m &= j - 1, \end{aligned}$$

1) Note that in (9), $E_{kl}^{p \times q} \otimes E_{jj}^{i \times i}$ is the unique irreducible element of $\langle E_{kl}^{p \times q} \otimes E_{jj}^{i \times i} \rangle$, and $E_{kl}^{p \times q} \otimes E_{j_1 j_2}^{i \times i}$ is the unique irreducible element of $\langle E_{kl}^{p \times q} \otimes E_{j_1 j_2}^{i \times i} \rangle$.

where

$$\begin{aligned}
 f_1 &= \gcd(i, j), \\
 f_2 &= \gcd(i, j - f_1), \\
 &\vdots \\
 f_{m'} &= \gcd\left(i, j - \sum_{\alpha=1}^{m'-1} f_\alpha\right), \\
 g_1 &= \gcd(i, j - 1), \\
 g_2 &= \gcd(i, j - 1 - g_1), \\
 &\vdots \\
 g_m &= \gcd\left(i, j - 1 - \sum_{\alpha=1}^{m-1} g_\alpha\right).
 \end{aligned} \tag{10}$$

We have

$$E_{jj}^{i \times i} = \left(\prod_{n'=1}^{m'} E_{\bar{j}'_{n'} \bar{j}'_{n'}}^{\bar{i}'_{n'} \times \bar{i}'_{n'}} \right) \vdash \left(\prod_{n=1}^m E_{\bar{j}_n \bar{j}_n}^{\bar{i}_n \times \bar{i}_n} \right), \tag{11}$$

where $\bar{i}'_{n'} = i/f_{n'}$, $\bar{j}'_{n'} = (j - \sum_{\alpha=1}^{n'-1} f_\alpha)/f_{n'}$, $n' = 1, 2, \dots, m'$; $\bar{i}_n = i/g_n$, $\bar{j}_n = (j - 1 - \sum_{\alpha=1}^{n-1} g_\alpha)/g_n$, $n = 1, 2, \dots, m$.

Then $\bar{j}'_{n'} \leq \bar{i}'_{n'}$, $\gcd(\bar{i}'_{n'}, \bar{j}'_{n'}) = 1$, $\bar{j}_n \leq \bar{i}_n$, $\gcd(\bar{i}_n, \bar{j}_n) = 1$, $\langle E_{kl}^{p \times q} \otimes E_{\bar{j}'_{n'} \bar{j}'_{n'}}^{\bar{i}'_{n'} \times \bar{i}'_{n'}} \rangle \in \mathbf{D}_\mu$, $\langle E_{kl}^{p \times q} \otimes E_{\bar{j}_n \bar{j}_n}^{\bar{i}_n \times \bar{i}_n} \rangle \in \mathbf{D}_\mu$, $k = 1, 2, \dots, p$, $l = 1, 2, \dots, q$, $n' = 1, 2, \dots, m'$, $n = 1, 2, \dots, m$, and by Theorem 2,

$$\langle E_{kl}^{p \times q} \otimes E_{jj}^{i \times i} \rangle = \left(\prod_{n'=1}^{m'} \langle E_{kl}^{p \times q} \otimes E_{\bar{j}'_{n'} \bar{j}'_{n'}}^{\bar{i}'_{n'} \times \bar{i}'_{n'}} \rangle \right) \vdash \left(\prod_{n=1}^m \langle E_{kl}^{p \times q} \otimes E_{\bar{j}_n \bar{j}_n}^{\bar{i}_n \times \bar{i}_n} \rangle \right) \tag{12}$$

is generated by \mathbf{D}_μ .

Case 2, $j_1 \neq j_2$:

Similar to the former case, if $\gcd(i, j_1, j_2) = 1$, then $\langle E_{kl}^{p \times q} \otimes E_{j_1 j_2}^{i \times i} \rangle \in \mathbf{N}_\mu$, and $\langle E_{kl}^{p \times q} \otimes E_{j_1 j_2}^{i \times i} \rangle$ is generated by (8). Next we consider the case $\gcd(i, j_1, j_2) > 1$, and assume that $j_1 < j_2$ without loss of generality. Write

$$f_1 + f_2 + \dots + f_{m'} = j_1, \tag{13}$$

$$g_1 + g_2 + \dots + g_m = j_1 - 1, \tag{14}$$

where

$$\begin{aligned}
 f_1 &= \gcd(i, j_1, j_2), \\
 f_2 &= \gcd(i, j_1 - f_1, j_2 - f_1), \\
 &\vdots \\
 f_{m'} &= \gcd\left(i, j_1 - \sum_{\alpha=1}^{m'-1} f_\alpha, j_2 - \sum_{\alpha=1}^{m'-1} f_\alpha\right), \\
 g_1 &= \gcd(i, j_1 - 1, j_2 - 1), \\
 g_2 &= \gcd(i, j_1 - 1 - g_1, j_2 - 1 - g_1), \\
 &\vdots \\
 g_m &= \gcd\left(i, j_1 - 1 - \sum_{\alpha=1}^{m-1} g_\alpha, j_2 - 1 - \sum_{\alpha=1}^{m-1} g_\alpha\right).
 \end{aligned} \tag{15}$$

We have

$$E_{j_1 j_2}^{i \times i} = \left(\prod_{n'=1}^{m'} E_{\bar{j}'_{1n'} \bar{j}'_{2n'}}^{\bar{i}'_{n'} \times \bar{i}'_{n'}} \right) \vdash \left(\prod_{n=1}^m E_{\bar{j}_{1n} \bar{j}_{2n}}^{\bar{i}_n \times \bar{i}_n} \right), \tag{16}$$

where $\bar{i}'_{n'} = i/f_{n'}$, $\bar{j}'_{1n'} = (j_1 - \sum_{\alpha=1}^{n'-1} f_\alpha)/f_{n'}$, $\bar{j}'_{2n'} = (j_2 - \sum_{\alpha=1}^{n'-1} f_\alpha)/f_{n'}$, $n' = 1, 2, \dots, m'$; $\bar{i}_n = i/g_n$, $\bar{j}_{1n} = (j_1 - 1 - \sum_{\alpha=1}^{n-1} g_\alpha)/g_n$, $\bar{j}_{2n} = (j_2 - 1 - \sum_{\alpha=1}^{n-1} g_\alpha)/g_n$, $n = 1, 2, \dots, m$.

Then $\bar{j}'_{1n'}, \bar{j}'_{2n'} \leq \bar{i}'_{n'}$, $\gcd(\bar{i}'_{n'}, \bar{j}'_{1n'}, \bar{j}'_{2n'}) = 1$, $\bar{j}_{1n}, \bar{j}_{2n} \leq \bar{i}_n$, $\gcd(\bar{i}_n, \bar{j}_{1n}, \bar{j}_{2n}) = 1$, $\langle E_{kl}^{p \times q} \otimes E_{\bar{j}'_{1n'} \bar{j}'_{2n'}}^{\bar{i}'_{n'} \times \bar{i}'_{n'}} \rangle \in \mathbf{N}_\mu$, $\langle E_{kl}^{p \times q} \otimes E_{\bar{j}_{1n} \bar{j}_{2n}}^{\bar{i}_n \times \bar{i}_n} \rangle \in \mathbf{N}_\mu$, $k = 1, 2, \dots, p$, $l = 1, 2, \dots, q$, $n' = 1, 2, \dots, m'$, $n = 1, 2, \dots, m$, and by Theorem 2,

$$\langle E_{kl}^{p \times q} \otimes E_{j_1 j_2}^{i \times i} \rangle = \left(\prod_{n'=1}^{m'} \langle E_{kl}^{p \times q} \otimes E_{\bar{j}'_{1n'} \bar{j}'_{2n'}}^{\bar{i}'_{n'} \times \bar{i}'_{n'}} \rangle \right) \vdash \left(\prod_{n=1}^m \langle E_{kl}^{p \times q} \otimes E_{\bar{j}_{1n} \bar{j}_{2n}}^{\bar{i}_n \times \bar{i}_n} \rangle \right) \tag{17}$$

is generated by \mathbf{N}_μ .

Based on the above, we have (6) is generated by (8), then by Proposition 1, (8) is a generator of (Σ_μ, \oplus) . Besides, by (12) and (17) we have every element of (Σ_μ, \oplus) is represented uniquely as a linear combination of finitely many elements of (8).

ii): To prove that every finite number of elements of (8) are linearly independent, we need to prove that every finite number of elements of D_μ are linearly independent and every finite number of elements of N_μ are linearly independent, because in each $E_{jj}^{i \times i}$, only diagonal entries can be nonzero, and in each $E_{j_1 j_2}^{i \times i}$ with $j_1 \neq j_2$, only nondiagonal entries can be nonzero.

To prove that every finite number of elements of D_μ are linearly independent, we need to prove that for all positive integers k, l, n satisfying that $1 \leq k \leq p$ and $1 \leq l \leq q$,

$$\bigcup_{i=1}^n \bigcup_{\substack{1 \leq j \leq i \\ \gcd(i,j)=1}} \left\{ \left\langle E_{kl}^{p \times q} \otimes E_{jj}^{i \times i} \right\rangle \right\} \tag{18}$$

are linearly independent. Write $t := \text{lcm}(1, 2, \dots, n)$, then (18) equals

$$\bigcup_{i=1}^n \bigcup_{\substack{1 \leq j \leq i \\ \gcd(i,j)=1}} \left\{ \left\langle E_{kl}^{p \times q} \otimes E_{jj}^{i \times i} \otimes I_{t/i} \right\rangle \right\}. \tag{19}$$

What is left is to prove the set

$$\{jt/i | 1 \leq i \leq n, 1 \leq j \leq i, \gcd(i, j) = 1\} \tag{20}$$

has the same cardinality as (19), because for each $E_{jj}^{i \times i} \otimes I_{t/i}$, the $(jt/i, jt/i)$ -th entry equals 1, and either $jt/i = t$ or the (s, s) -th entry equals 0 for each integer $s > jt/i$.

Suppose there exist positive integers i_1, j_1, i_2, j_2 such that $1 \leq j_1 \leq i_1, 1 \leq j_2 \leq i_2, \gcd(i_1, j_1) = \gcd(i_2, j_2) = 1$, and $j_1 t/i_1 = j_2 t/i_2$, then $i_1 = i_2$ and $j_1 = j_2$. Hence the set (20) has the same cardinality as the set (19).

To prove that every finite number of elements of N_μ are linearly independent, similar to the case for D_μ , we need to prove that for all positive integers k, l, n satisfying that $n \geq 2, 1 \leq k \leq p$ and $1 \leq l \leq q$,

$$\bigcup_{i=2}^n \bigcup_{\substack{1 \leq j_1, j_2 \leq i \\ j_1 \neq j_2 \\ \gcd(i, j_1, j_2)=1}} \left\{ \left\langle E_{kl}^{p \times q} \otimes E_{j_1 j_2}^{i \times i} \right\rangle \right\} \tag{21}$$

are linearly independent. Write $\text{lcm}(2, \dots, n) =: t$, then (21) equals

$$\bigcup_{i=2}^n \bigcup_{\substack{1 \leq j_1, j_2 \leq i \\ j_1 \neq j_2 \\ \gcd(i, j_1, j_2)=1}} \left\{ \left\langle E_{kl}^{p \times q} \otimes E_{j_1 j_2}^{i \times i} \otimes I_{t/i} \right\rangle \right\}. \tag{22}$$

What is left is to prove the set

$$\{(j_1 t/i, j_2 t/i) | 1 \leq i \leq n, 1 \leq j_1, j_2 \leq i, j_1 \neq j_2, \gcd(i, j_1, j_2) = 1\} \tag{23}$$

has the same cardinality as (22), because for each $E_{j_1 j_2}^{i \times i} \otimes I_{t/i}$, the $(j_1 t/i, j_2 t/i)$ -th entry equals 1, and either $j_1 t/i = t$, or $j_2 t/i = t$, or the $(j_1 t/i + s, j_2 t/i + s)$ -th entry equals 0 for each positive integer s .

Suppose there exist positive integers $i_1, j_1^1, j_2^1, i_2, j_1^2, j_2^2$ such that $1 \leq j_1^1, j_2^1 \leq i_1, 1 \leq j_1^2, j_2^2 \leq i_2, j_1^1 \neq j_2^1, j_1^2 \neq j_2^2, \gcd(i_1, j_1^1, j_2^1) = \gcd(i_2, j_1^2, j_2^2) = 1, j_1^1 t/i_1 = j_2^1 t/i_2$, and $j_2^2 t/i_1 = j_2^2 t/i_2$, then $i_1 = i_2, j_1^1 = j_1^2$ and $j_2^1 = j_2^2$. This follows from the discussion below. i) Suppose $\gcd(i_1, j_1^1) = 1$ and $i_1 \neq i_2$, then $i_1 | i_2, i_2/i_1 =: t > 1$, and $\gcd(i_2, j_1^2, j_2^2) = \gcd(t i_1, t j_1^1, t j_2^1) = t > 1$, which is a contradiction. ii) Suppose $\gcd(i_1, j_1^1) > 1, i_1 \neq i_2$ and $\gcd(i_2, j_1^2) = 1$, then similarly $i_2 | i_1$, and $\gcd(i_1, j_1^1, j_2^1) = i_1/i_2 > 1$, which is also a contradiction. iii) Suppose $\gcd(i_1, j_1^1) =: t > 1, i_1 \neq i_2$ and $\gcd(i_2, j_1^2) =: s > 1$, then $\gcd(i_1/t, j_1^1/t) = \gcd(i_2/s, j_1^2/s) = 1, i_1/t = i_2/s, \gcd(t, s) | j_2^1, \gcd(t, s) | j_2^2, t \neq s$ (if $t = s$, then $i_1 = i_2$, a contradiction), $\gcd(i_1, j_1^1, j_2^1) \geq t / \gcd(t, s) > 1$ or $\gcd(i_2, j_1^2, j_2^2) \geq s / \gcd(t, s) > 1$, which is again a contradiction. Hence the set (23) has the same cardinality as the set (22), which completes the proof.

References

1 D. Cheng. On equivalence of matrices. *Asian Journal of Mathematics*, to appear, <https://arxiv.org/abs/1605.09523v3>, 2016.